

Pediatric flexible airway endoscopy training during a pandemic and beyond: Bending the curve.

Albin Leong, MD, ATSF; Dan Benscoter, DO; John Brewington, MD; Cherie Torres-Silva, MD, MPH, MEd; Robert E Wood, PhD, MD¹

From the Division of Pulmonary Medicine, Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center, Cincinnati, Ohio

¹ Corresponding author

Commentary

Flexible airway endoscopy, for diagnostic and therapeutic purposes, is a vital aspect of pediatric pulmonology practice, and has become an integral aspect of formal training in pediatric pulmonology. Achieving competency in flexible airway endoscopy requires mastery of several skills, including cognitive (learning anatomy, recognition of pathology, etc.) and manual (manipulating the instrument safely and effectively, etc.). To acquire the cognitive and manual skills of flexible airway endoscopy, there has been no adequate substitute for direct procedural experience in patients. In pediatric pulmonology, the opportunities for such experience vary widely among training programs, many of which can offer only limited experience.

The pandemic COVID-19 caused by SARS-CoV-2 has resulted in significant disruption to healthcare, including medical training^{1,2}. Because this virus is primarily transmitted by respiratory droplets, aerosol-generating procedures, especially bronchoscopy, pose a special danger to health care workers. Multiple adult bronchology societies have issued guidelines about the role of bronchoscopy and protection of health care workers during the COVID-19 pandemic. All the guidelines recommend limiting personnel present during the procedure, including on patients not suspected of COVID-19, as well as prioritizing and limiting elective bronchoscopies. These guidelines do acknowledge relying on consensus due to limited evidence of studies during this new pandemic³⁻⁵. The consequences of the pandemic include potentially dramatic reduction in the opportunities of hands-on learning for pediatric pulmonology training. As a result, this could cause a significant educational lacuna for current fellows.

In the setting of caution on scheduling aerosol-generating procedures and consequently restricted opportunities for hands-on experience, how can trainees develop proficiency in performing bronchoscopy? For surgical resident training, several alternative approaches have been proposed, including remote training platforms with

pre-recorded lectures, online practice questions, teleconferencing and telemedicine, procedural simulation, surgical videos, and developing competency tests⁶⁻⁸.

A survey of training in pediatric flexible bronchoscopy in the US published in 2014 revealed that the apprentice model, with volume-based ascertainment of competency, was the primary method utilized by pediatric pulmonology training directors⁹. There are currently no evidence-based competency guidelines for pediatric flexible bronchoscopy. A suggested list of core competencies for pediatric flexible airway endoscopy is published in the Official ATS Technical Standards document¹⁰. In addition, the Supplement to the Technical Standards lists some tools for online learning of clinical assessment and performance from the American Thoracic Society, Bronchoscopy International, and a series on YouTube by Dr. Henri Colt, though these tools are primarily on adult flexible bronchoscopy¹¹⁻¹³.

Studies in adult bronchoscopy training have shown variability in performance, and that procedure numbers are not a sufficient tool to assess competency. An Expert Panel on adult bronchoscopy training has suggested “professional societies and certifying agencies move from a volume-based certification system to a standardized skill acquisition and knowledge-based competency assessment for pulmonary and thoracic trainees¹⁴.”

Computerized bronchoscopy simulators have been studied as a method to develop competency (learning anatomy as well as manipulation of the bronchoscope). Several groups have reported that simulation can result in the development of significant skills, and simulators can also provide a mechanism for assessing those skills, including the attainment and maintenance of proficiency¹⁵⁻¹⁸. There are online virtual bronchoscopy simulation tools available as well as commercial products¹⁹⁻²¹. Currently available virtual simulators, however, are not designed for pediatrics and are thus inadequate for pediatric training.

Simulation training in adult bronchoscopy has evolved. The American College of Chest Physicians (ACCP) has an innovative Bronchoscopy Certificate of Completion (COC) program designed for adult bronchoscopy including cognitive as well as psychomotor skills for basic and advanced bronchoscopy involving transbronchial needle aspiration and endobronchial ultrasound utilizing simulation technology. The ACCP, with its Advanced Clinical Training Program, was the first society to receive accreditation from the Society for Simulation in Healthcare²².

In addition to virtual simulators, cheaper alternatives with simple inanimate models have been used. Recently, more sophisticated and realistic models for adult bronchoscopy training have been developed utilizing 3D-printed airways. There is also the potential of using a 3D model of a specific patient case for pre-procedural training and planning^{17, 23, 24}.

Before the pandemic, many pediatric pulmonary physicians have taken a formal course, which has been offered in the US since 1981 by Wood and colleagues. Similar courses have been offered in Europe and Asia. These courses have included lectures, video presentations of anatomy and pathologies, and demonstrations as well as hands-on experience in various non-human models, and have been a vital aspect of initial training. However, the pandemic has resulted in classroom and hands-on training opportunities being currently prohibited; it is unclear when traditional training can resume. The didactic material from the Cincinnati Children's Hospital Medical Center (CCHMC) course is now available online, by subscription, but hands-on training will remain a significant problem for the immediate future.

Traditionally, animal models have been used for initial training²⁵. However, due to societal pressure and other factors, despite their many advantages, the use of live animals for training purposes has fallen out of favor. The development of inanimate models for medical training has been a quantum leap forward, but models currently

available commercially have serious limitations. Other models, appropriate for pediatric training, have been reported, but also have significant limitations^{26,27}.

At CCHMC, we have recently developed a high-fidelity model based on an 18-month-old child, using a combination of CT scan data and artistic enhancement, guided by video recordings of pediatric bronchoscopy procedures and detailed iterative feedback from experienced bronchoscopists. This model includes the entire airway accessible to flexible bronchoscopes, from nostrils to 6th generation bronchi, and is highly accurate. There are realistic haptic qualities, and the model can be used for experience with BAL and clearing of secretions, as well as other interventional procedures. The first generation of this model was introduced for the 2019 Pediatric Flexible Bronchoscopy Course at CCHMC and is now in further development for commercial distribution.

Teaching with a model should involve more than the development of manual skills in driving the instrument. The addition of clinically relevant scenarios to challenge students can be not only stimulating, but vital to establishing an approach for performance of bronchoscopy in patients. Teaching is an art...

The education of current and future trainees for pediatric flexible airway endoscopy is presently unsettled. The challenges of procedural medical training during the pandemic have necessitated different approaches to the traditional method of primarily apprentice training. In the relative absence of clinical experience, trainees will need more formalized didactic instruction regarding anatomy and pathology, as well as the basic psychomotor aspects of endoscopy. During this and any future pandemic or when a training program can offer only limited bronchoscopy experience, it is incumbent upon training directors to utilize all available opportunities for learning. These would specifically include models or simulators from our adult colleagues in order to give pediatric fellows the best possible training, even if this training is not specifically pediatric. This is a time of opportunity to capitalize on innovative solutions to adapt and

improve future training, maintenance of cognitive knowledge and psychomotor skills, and their assessment. Despite the pandemic, we must learn to bend the curve of training to adapt and progress.

1. G
ordon M, Patricio M, Horne L, Muston A, Alston SR, Pammi M, Thammasitboon S, Park S, Pawlikowska T, Rees EL, Doyle AJ, Daniel M. Developments in medical education in response to the COVID-19 pandemic: A rapid BEME systematic review: BEME Guide No. 63. Med Teach. 2020; 42: 1202-1215.
2. M
allon D, Pohl JF, Phatak UP, Fernandes M, Rosen JM, Lusman SS, Nylund CM, Jump CS, Solomon AB, Srinath A, et al; NASPGHAN Training Committee COVID-19 Survey Working Group. Impact of COVID-19 on Pediatric Gastroenterology Fellow Training in North America. J Pediatr Gastroenterol Nutr. 2020;71: 6-11.
3. P
ritchett MA, Oberg CL, Belanger A, De Cardenas J, Cheng G, Cumbo Nacheli G, Franco-Paredes C, Singh J, Toth J, Zgoda M, Folch E. Society for Advanced Bronchoscopy Consensus Statement and Guidelines for bronchoscopy and airway management amid the COVID-19 pandemic. J Thorac Dis 2020; 12: 1781-1798
4. L
entz RJ, Colt H. Summarizing societal guidelines regarding bronchoscopy during the COVID-19 pandemic. Respirology. 2020. 25: 574-577.
5. W
ahidi MM, Shojaee S, Lamb CR, Ost D, Maldonado F, Eapen G, Caroff DA, Stevens MP, Ouellette DR, Lilly C, et al. The Use of Bronchoscopy During the Coronavirus Disease 2019 Pandemic: CHEST/AABIP Guideline and Expert Panel Report. Chest. 2020; 158: 1268-1281.
6. M
cKechnie T, Levin M, Zhou K, Freedman B, Palter VN, Grantcharov TP. Virtual

Surgical Training During COVID-19: Operating Room Simulation Platforms

Accessible From Home. Ann Surg. 2020; 272: e153-4.

7. C
hick RC, Clifton GT, Peace KM, Propper BW, Hale DF, Alseidi AA, Vreeland TJ. Using Technology to Maintain the Education of Residents During the COVID-19 Pandemic. J Surg Educ. 2020;77: 729-732.
8. G
arcía Vazquez A, Verde JM, Dal Mas F, Palermo M, Cobiañchi L, Marescaux J, Gallix B, Dallemagne B, Perretta S, Gimenez ME. Image-Guided Surgical e-Learning in the Post-COVID-19 Pandemic Era: What Is Next? J Laparoendosc Adv Surg Tech A. 2020;30: 993-997.
9. L
eong AB, Green CG, Kurland G, Wood RE. A survey of training in pediatric flexible bronchoscopy. Pediatr Pulmonol. 2014;49: 605-10.
10. F
aro A, Wood RE, Schechter MS, Leong AB, Wittkugel E, Abode K, Chmiel JF, Daines C, Davis S, Eber E, et al. American Thoracic Society Ad Hoc Committee on Flexible Airway Endoscopy in Children. Official American Thoracic Society technical standards: flexible airway endoscopy in children. Am J Respir Crit Care Med. 2015; 191: 1066-80.
11. h
<https://www.thoracic.org/professionals/clinical-resources/video-lecture-series/bronchoscopy/>
12. h
<https://bronchoscopy.org>
13. h
<https://www.youtube.com/user/bronchorg%23p/c/29BD464130B411C6/0/phRv73lk7fl>

14. E
rnst A, Momen, Wahidi,MM, Read CA, Buckley JD, Addrizzo-Harris DJ, Shah PL, FelJ. Herth FF, de Hoyos Parra A, Ornelas J, Yarmus L, Silvestri GA. Adult Bronchoscopy Training: Current State and Suggestions for the Future: CHEST Expert Panel Report. Chest. 2015; 148: 321–332.
15. V
eaudor M, Gérinière L, Souquet P-J, Druette L, Martin X, Vergnon J-M, Couraud S. High-fidelity simulation self-training enables novice bronchoscopists to acquire basic bronchoscopy skills comparable to their moderately and highly experienced counterparts. BMC Med Educ. 2018; 18: 191. Published online 2018 Aug 7.
16. K
ennedy CC, Maldonado F, Cook DA. Simulation-based bronchoscopy training: systematic review and meta-analysis. Chest 2013; 144: 183-192.
17. N
ilsson PM, Naur TMH, Clementsen PF, Konge L. Simulation in bronchoscopy: current and future perspectives. Adv Med Educ Pract. 2017; 8: 755–760.
18. S
iddaiah-Subramanya M, Smith S, Lonie J. Mastery learning: how is it helpful? An analytical review. Adv Med Educ Pract. 2017; 8:269–275. Published online 2017 Apr 5.
19. h
http://pie.med.utoronto.ca/VB/VB_content/simulation.html
20. h
http://www.thoracic-anesthesia.com/?page_id=2
21. h
<https://www.intelligentultrasound.com/orsim-5/orsim-6/>

22. h
<https://www.chestnet.org/Education/Advanced-Clinical-Training/Certificate-of-Completion-Program/Bronchoscopy>
23. P
edersen TH, Gysin J, Wegmann A, Osswald M, Ott SR, Theiler L, Greif R. A randomised, controlled trial evaluating a low cost, 3D-printed bronchoscopy simulator. *Anaesthesia*. 2017; 72: 1005-1009.
24. H
o BHK, Chen CJ, Tan GJS, Yeong WY, Tan HKJ, Lim AYH, Ferenczi MA, Mogali SR. Multi-material three dimensional printed models for simulation of bronchoscopy. *BMC Med Educ*. 2019; 19: 236.
25. W
ood RE, Pick JR. Model systems for teaching pediatric flexible bronchoscopy. *Pediatr Pulmonol* 8: 168-171, 1990.
26. H
ornung A, Kumpf M, Baden W, Tsiflikas I, Hofbeck M, Sieverding L. Realistic 3D-Printed Tracheobronchial Tree Model from a 1-Year-Old Girl for Pediatric Bronchoscopy Training. *Respiration*. 2017; 93: 293-295.
27. D
eBoer EM, Wagner J, Kroehl ME, Albietz J, Shandas R, Deterding RR, Rustici MJ. Three-Dimensional Printed Pediatric Airway Model Improves Novice Learners' Flexible Bronchoscopy Skills With Minimal Direct Teaching From Faculty. *Simul Healthc*. 2018;13: 284-288.

